

Submission No.			289	
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			Terenure West Residents Association	
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
Submitted by Michele Van Valey Hon. Secretary TWRA on behalf of Terenure West Residents Association				
1	Letter	1	<p>This is a submission on behalf of Terenure West Residents Association c/o. We represent residents of about 600 houses in the western part of Terenure bounded by Terenure Road West, Fortfield Road and Greenlea Road.</p> <p>We fully welcome the decision to link the city centre to Swords via the airport, which we believe will indirectly help those we represent access the airport and other north city areas without using a car.</p>	<p>TII appreciates the submission and notes the overall endorsement of the MetroLink Project. We have reviewed the submission and responded to the observations made below.</p>
2	Letter	1	<p>We believe however that the needs of our area and the greater south west city will only be met by a metro into the south west city, which has a stop in our case, somewhere in the Terenure area. Further we reject completely the assertion by various transport bodies, particularly National Transport Authority, that buses alone will cater for the public transport needs of the south west city including Terenure. Indeed they themselves issued a Strategy Development and Modelling Report in connection with their draft Dublin area plan in November 2021. In that document at page 91 they forecast passenger demand per hour of 6,600 on the Harold’s Cross Road and 9,300 on the Rathmines Road corridor, way beyond the capacity of any bus system . However buses do have an important role if they facilitate proper connectivity. We note that in census 2022 the southside area between the two existing Luas lines has a population of over 350,000. We believe that in the interests of proper planning and development, any strategic decision about public transport needs to reflect these two core issues (metro to south west and bus connectivity).</p>	<p>While the provision of bus services do not fall within the scope of the MetroLink Project or within the remit of TII, it is of note that the proposed MetroLink route alignment from Estuary to Charlemont is consistent and compliant with the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042 (published in January 2023) which states that the south city terminus at Charlemont is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise.</p> <p>Future metro services to the Terenure area do not form part of the Metrolink scheme as presented under the Railway Order. TII's role is to deliver Metrolink as supported by the Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042) and Dublin City Development Plan 2022-2028 . The connection from St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Ranelagh is supported by the current Transport Strategy. The Transport Strategies were prepared by the National Transport Authority, scrutinised by the Joint Oireachtas Committee on Transport and approved by the Minister for Transport. It notes in section 12.3.2, "Charlemont offers the optimal location for the primary interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise."</p>

Submission No.			289	
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			Terenure West Residents Association	
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
Submitted by Michele Van Valey Hon. Secretary TWRA on behalf of Terenure West Residents Association				
3	Letter	1	<p>To our regret ,the current proposals for metro do not respect these principles. It is our view that while a metro station at St Stephen's Green as proposed does allow metro linkage to the south west city and indeed anywhere else southside, this is not the case with Charlemont. A Charlemont terminus constrains the options for extension into the south city. We believe that it is simply not possible to continue a line from Charlemont to either Rathmines or Harold's Cross which are populous suburbs. Further we believe that the range of potential locations for a station serving Terenure would be prejudiced by having to extend a metro line from Charlemont. Therefore we think it is bad planning for all of the south city to have the south city terminus at Charlemont.</p>	<p>It is proposed to run MetroLink to a station at Charlemont for the reasons explained below. Response (2) above addresses your observation regards the possible extension of Metro to Rathmines or Harold's Cross, while as also noted by response (2), extension to the southwest, including Terenure, of the proposed Charlemont Station would be possible if the need for it was justified.</p> <p>The Board is required to have regard to the likely consequences for proper planning and sustainable development in the area in which it is proposed to carry out railway works (section 43(1) of the 2001 Act) and as such the following matters are relevant.</p> <p>The connection from St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Ranelagh is supported by the current Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042). The Transport Strategies were prepared by the National Transport Authority, scrutinised by the Joint Oireachtas Committee on Transport and approved by the Minister for Transport. It notes in section 12.3.2, "Charlemont offers the optimal location for the primary interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise."</p> <p>The Transport Strategy is "a consideration material to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area or areas in question." Development Plans are required to be consistent with the Transport Strategy. The Dublin City Development Plan 2022-2028 envisages this station at Charlemont in policy SMT22 "To support the expeditious delivery of key sustainable transport projects so as to provide an integrated public transport network with efficient interchange between transport modes, serving the existing and future needs of the city and region and to support the integration of existing public transport infrastructure with other transport modes. In particular the following projects subject to environmental requirements and appropriate planning consents being obtained: ... MetroLink from Charlemont to Swords".</p> <p>Accordingly, the location of the Charlemont station was a strategic decision made at the highest levels of transport and land use planning and such is fully consistent with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.</p> <p>The current Transport Strategy considers a range of options for the onward extension of MetroLink to meet the demand for travel over the period of the strategy. This includes consideration of the need for the upgrade of the Luas Green Line to metro with a metro extension to Dublin south west, south or south east. Whilst the strategy envisages that further extensions will be delivered after 2042, MetroLink which terminates at Charlemont allows for the possible extension of the metro in all any of the above directions.</p> <p>The proximity of the metro to the Luas line at Charlemont provides for a positive customer experience for all users with short interchange distance and due to the proximity, clear wayfinding and high visibility of the interchange. The interchange arrangements at Charlemont provide for significantly better interchange arrangements compared to an interchange at St Stephen's Green Station.</p> <p>The detailed analysis done for the Railway Order application further confirms that the section of MetroLink route between St Stephen's Green and Charlemont Stations contributes significantly to the overall benefits of the scheme. It serves a significant area of the south city of Dublin and offers enhanced access from the local area to the city centre and a direct connection to Dublin Airport. It serves key trip attractors including residential areas and offices / workplace locations, with high passenger boarding and alighting figures in the peak hours. During the morning peak, at Charlemont station the flows include 1,800 passengers alighting, 2,300 boarding and 1,229 passengers alighting, 2,276 boarding during the evening peak. This is detailed in Chapter 7 (Consideration of Alternatives) section 7.7.8. The passenger numbers contribute significantly to the overall benefits of the scheme and the effect of these benefits outweigh the additional costs that are associated with the delivery and operation of the section from St Stephen's Green to Charlemont station.</p> <p>The location of the interchange at Charlemont does not preclude onward extension south. An interchange at Charlemont is supported by policy including the Dublin City Development Plan 2022 - 2028 and the Transport Strategy for the Greater Dublin Area.</p> <p>By extending MetroLink to Charlemont it provides for future proofing of the Green Line, bypassing the capacity constrained Luas on-street running section, and ensures potential future connectivity options are enabled, either to the Green Line or for extensions of the metro.</p> <p>The Charlemont Station interchange provides for increased passenger utilisation of the MetroLink system, thereby increasing the benefits delivered by the Project, reflected by an improved Project Benefit Cost Ration (BCR).</p>

Submission No.			289	
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			Terenure West Residents Association	
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
Submitted by Michele Van Valey Hon. Secretary TWRA on behalf of Terenure West Residents Association				
4	Letter	1	On the assumption that BusConnects is to proceed as planned, the "workhorse" of services for much of Terenure will be the A spine. Alone of the eight radial spines, it seems to be the only one which will not intersect with the metro on the southside in or close to the city centre. On this basis alone we are shocked that the documents submitted to you give no consideration whatever to routing the metro towards Rathmines, where there could be an easy connection to A buses. We believe it is fundamental to proper planning that each spine be linked to the metro at some point convenient to the city centre.	As noted by response (3) above, and in accordance with the policy set by the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042 (published in January 2023), Charlemont is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise.  Please refer to response item (2) in relation to future extensions of MetroLink.
5	Letter	2	Further if indeed there is to be a metro station at Charlemont, it is likely that some people will opt to walk from Rathmines Road to the metro at Charlemont. Indeed many people currently leave buses at South Richmond Street and walk on the city side of the canal to access the Georgian Quarter around Fitzwilliam Street. The pedestrian infrastructure here however is not satisfactory and we are surprised that no thought is given in the plans submitted to you to upgrading the pedestrian infrastructure between the Rathmines Road corridor and the suggested metro station given the likelihood that some bus passengers will see an approximately 10 minute journey on foot as an option. We would note that under current BusConnects plans, Lower Rathmines Road is to be closed to through car traffic, it will have 7 separate bus routes and in the aggregate more than a bus per minute.	The scope of the MetroLink Project does not extend to improving the wider transport network and is limited to the immediate area surrounding the proposed Charlemont Station, including the interchange with the Luas Green Line at Charlemont.  EIAR Appendix A9.2-B presents a Traffic and Transportation Assessment of Charlemont Station during the Operational Phase. A microsimulation VisWalk model has been developed for the immediate area surrounding Charlemont Station. The model indicates that with the new pedestrian infrastructure in place (additional staircase to Luas interchange and repositioning of pedestrian crossing on Grand Parade) the model displays an acceptable level of network performance in the assessment. Transport modelling as part of the Project includes the implementation of BusConnects Network Redesign and the Core Bus Corridors (including the associated changes to pedestrian infrastructure). The quality of pedestrian infrastructure associated with the BusConnects project is outside the scope of the MetroLink project when not directly interfacing with the proposed Charlemont Station. Where direct interface is provided, TII have worked closely with BusConnects to ensure adequate provisions are made to facilitate seamless interchange between the modes.
6	Letter	2	We believe that survey after survey shows that the south west city has a disproportionate share of population commuting by car as compared with other areas. This is likely primarily caused by the lack of a rail option. Metro is the only alternative likely to attract the sort of switch over that is needed. If this were done, the environmental benefits in terms of less pollution, less congested and safer streets and less emissions would be huge.	As noted by response (3) above, and in accordance with the policy set by the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042 (published in January 2023), Charlemont is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise.
7	Letter	2	We note also the many problematic issues with the Charlemont station summarised on the website misplacedterminus.ie and in particular the less than satisfactory connection between metro and Green Line Luas at Charlemont.	Please refer to response (3) above that explains the rationale for the proposed location of a MetroLink Station at Charlemont. TII do not consider there are "many problematic issues with the Charlemont station".  With regards to the observation "less than satisfactory connection between metro and Green Line Luas at Charlemont.", as noted by response (5) above, a microsimulation VisWalk model has been developed for the immediate area surrounding Charlemont Station during the operational phase. The model covers the full extent of the publicly accessible station area, including the immediate vicinity of the station entrance at street level, the Luas stop and nearby junctions at Charlemont Bridge. In order to accommodate the forecast demand from the proposed Charlemont Station, a new staircase with 2.4m stair width is proposed at the south east corner of Charlemont Luas stop. An elevator will also be provided at this location. Both are sized for MetroLink to Luas, and Luas to MetroLink passenger numbers.
8	Letter	2	We would accordingly submit that you should omit the Charlemont station and the part of the line serving it from any Railway Order you approve.	The above responses to the observations made explain why TII do not consider it is correct or appropriate that the MetroLink alignment does not extend to Charlemont, and also demonstrates why the proposed Charlemont Station has been selected by TII as the preferred interchange with the Luas Green Line  Any decision to terminate the scheme prior to Charlemont will significantly impact on the overall viability and benefits of scheme.